US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

AUG 13 2013

OFFICE OF
SOLID WASTE AND
EMERGENCY RESPONSE

Mr. Ted Lozier
Division of Water
Ohio Department of Natural Resources
2045 Morse Road
Building B-2
Columbus, Ohio 43229-6693

Dear Mr. Lozier:

I am writing to provide you with an update on the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) structural integrity assessments of the surface impoundments containing coal combustion residuals at electric utilities located in your state.

After the catastrophic release of coal ash from the Tennessee Valley Authority's Kingston, Tennessee facility in December 2008, the EPA, in collaboration with the states, undertook a nationwide comprehensive effort to assess the structural integrity of surface impoundments and similar units that contain coal combustion residuals. The purpose of the assessments was to determine whether the units are structurally stable or whether any corrective measures were needed, and, if so, to work with each facility to secure its commitment to complete any necessary corrective measures. We thank you for your assistance and support throughout this process.

All above ground units with maximum embankment heights of greater than six (6) feet at facilities in your state have been assessed by experts in dam safety, working under the direction of the EPA. Each facility has received or will shortly receive, a final report containing recommendations for corrective measures or studies needed to ensure the ongoing structural integrity of their impoundments and each facility has submitted an action plan to the EPA setting out how they plan to implement the recommendations.[1] The EPA's assessment effort was an extraordinary effort undertaken due to the critical need to ensure the structural integrity of these units. The EPA was able to bring dam safety experts in quickly and to subject these units nationwide to the same scrutiny. The assessments, analyses, reports and recommendations constitute a critical body of information which serves all of us in our ongoing efforts to protect human health and the environment. For complete information on structural integrity assessments, analyses, reports, and recommendations, please visit the EPA's website at *http://www.epa.gov/osw/nonhaz/industrial/special/fossil/surveys2/*.

These assessments, however, reflect the condition of each unit at the point in time during which each assessment took place. Going forward, an ongoing routine program to assess these units and take any needed corrective measures is required to ensure the units' continued structural integrity. The continuing responsibility to ensure that these units are structurally sound lies first with each facility's owner and

[1] We invited representatives from your State to accompany EPA on the site assessments; we also provided the States an opportunity to submit comments on the draft reports and have provided the States a copy of the final report.

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

operator; however, you have an important role in monitoring and overseeing these units. We are therefore providing you this information to aid in your ongoing efforts.

We have enclosed a summary table for the facilities and units in your state. In addition, we will provide you with all the information from the EPA's assessment effort for each facility within your state for your use in the monitoring and oversight of these units. In those situations where we have not completed the assessment process for a particular unit, we will note that fact in the summary table. When we have completed the process, we will provide you all of the information on that unit. We would be happy to discuss any of this information with you and will provide the EPA contact when we forward you the detailed information. We also note that should the agency become aware of a situation where there is threat of release or other potential endangerment to human health or the environment, the EPA may take appropriate action. In such circumstances, the EPA will coordinate with you to ensure that measures protective of human health and the environment are taken in a timely fashion.

We again thank you for your cooperation throughout the assessment process and encourage you to continue your efforts to ensure the structural integrity of these units.

Sincerely,

Mathy Stanislaus

Mathy Stanislaus
Assistant Administrator

Enclosure

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

OHIO

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
American Electric Power	General James Gavin Power Plant (2)	Yes	OH	Bottom Ash Pond	High	Fair
				Stingy Run Dam	High	Fair

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
American Electric Power	Cardinal (3)	Yes	OH	Fly Ash Reservoir No. 1 (Decomissioned in 1991)	Low	Satisfactory
				Bottom Ash Complex (Bottom Ash Pond and Recirculation Pond)	Significant	Fair
				Fly Ash Reservoir No. 2	High	Satisfactory

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
American Electric Power	Conesville Power Station (1)	Yes	OH	Ash Pond complex	Significant	Fair

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Duke Energy	Miami Fort Station (2)	Yes	OH	Ash Pond A	Significant	Fair
				Ash Pond B	Significant	Fair

NOTE: "*" Signifies that a Company has claimed Confidential Business Information (CBI) for that particular facility and Final Reports and/or Action Plans contain CBI and have not been publicly released. All documents that **DO NOT** fall under a claim of CBI (Draft Reports, Comments, Final Reports, Recommendations Letters and Action Plans), may be found at http://www.epa.gov/osw/nonhaz/industrial/special/fossil/surveys2/

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Dayton Light & Power Co	**JM Stuart Station (5)**	Yes	OH	**Ash Pond 3A**	Significant	**Fair**
				Ash Pond 5	Significant	**Poor**
				Ash Pond 6	Significant	**Poor**
				Ash Pond7/7A	Significant	**Poor**
				Ash Pond 10	Significant	**Satisfactory**

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Ohio Valley Elec Corp	**Kyger Creek Station (2)**	Yes	OH	**Bottom Ash Pond**	High	**Poor**
				South Fly Ash Pond	High	**Poor**

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
American Electric Power	**Muskingum River (4)**	Yes	OH	**Upper Fly Ash Reservoir Dams (Mill Stone Creek, No-Name Creek, Wing, Spillway, and Freeboard Dams)**	High	**Satisfactory**
				Middle Fly Ash Reservoir Dams	High	**Fair**
				Lower Fly Ash Reservoir Dam	High	**Fair**
				Units 1-4 Bottom Ash Pond Dam	Significant	**Poor**

NOTE: "*" Signifies that a Company has claimed Confidential Business Information (CBI) for that particular facility and Final Reports and/or Action Plans contain CBI and have not been publicly released. All documents that **DO NOT** fall under a claim of CBI (Draft Reports, Comments, Final Reports, Recommendations Letters and Action Plans), may be found at http://www.epa.gov/osw/nonhaz/industrial/special/fossil/surveys2/

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Duke Energy	WC Beckjord Station (4)	Yes	OH	Ash Pond A	Significant	Poor
				Ash Pond B	Significant	Poor
				Ash Pond C	Significant	Poor
				Ash Pond C Extension	Significant	Poor

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Duke Energy	WH Zimmer Generating Station (1)	Yes	OH	Wastewater Pond Complex	Low	Satisfactory

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Dayton Power & Light Co	O.H. Hutchings Station (3)	Yes	OH	East Primary Settling Pond	Significant	Poor
				Secondary Settling Pond	Significant	Poor
				West Primary Settling Pond	Significant	Poor

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
American Electric Power	Columbus Southern Power Co - Picway Power Station (1)	Yes	OH	Ash Pond	Significant	Satisfactory

NOTE: "*" Signifies that a Company has claimed Confidential Business Information (CBI) for that particular facility and Final Reports and/or Action Plans contain CBI and have not been publicly released. All documents that **DO NOT** fall under a claim of CBI (Draft Reports, Comments, Final Reports, Recommendations Letters and Action Plans), may be found at http://www.epa.gov/osw/nonhaz/industrial/special/fossil/surveys2/

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

Company	Facility (Number of Units)	Action Plan	State	Impoundment Name	Hazard Potential	Final Report Condition Rating
Dayton Power & Light Co	**Killen Station (2)**	Yes	OH	**Bottom Ash Pond**	High	Poor
				Fly Ash Pond	High	Poor

NOTE: "*" Signifies that a Company has claimed Confidential Business Information (CBI) for that particular facility and Final Reports and/or Action Plans contain CBI and have not been publicly released. All documents that **DO NOT** fall under a claim of CBI (Draft Reports, Comments, Final Reports, Recommendations Letters and Action Plans), may be found at http://www.epa.gov/osw/nonhaz/industrial/special/fossil/surveys2/

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

CONDITION RATINGS

The condition rating of an impoundment represents an assessment of the overall expected performance of the impoundment at the time of assessment considering all pertinent engineering conditions. Each impoundment at each facility was rated using the following categories:

Satisfactory
No existing or potential management unit safety deficiencies are recognized. Acceptable performance is expected under all applicable loading conditions (static, hydrologic, seismic) in accordance with the applicable criteria. Minor maintenance items may be required.

Fair
Acceptable performance is expected under all required loading conditions (static, hydrologic, seismic) in accordance with the applicable safety regulatory criteria. Minor deficiencies may exist that require remedial action and/or secondary studies or investigations.

Poor
A management unit safety deficiency is recognized for a required loading condition (static, hydrologic, seismic) in accordance with the applicable dam safety regulatory criteria. Remedial action is necessary. "Poor" also applies when further critical studies or investigations are needed to identify any potential dam safety deficiencies.

Unsatisfactory
Considered unsafe. A dam safety deficiency is recognized that requires immediate or emergency remedial action for problem resolution. Reservoir restrictions may be necessary.

HAZARD POTENTIAL RATINGS

The hazard potential ratings refer to the potential for loss of life or damage if there is a dam failure. The ratings do not refer to the structural stability of the dam. Specifically:

High Hazard Potential
Dams assigned the high hazard potential classification are those where failure or mis-operation will probably cause loss of human life.

US EPA ARCHIVE DOCUMENT

Significant Hazard Potential

Dams assigned the significant hazard potential classification are those dams where failure or mis-operation results in no probable loss of human life, but can cause economic loss, environment damage, disruption of lifeline facilities, or impact other concerns. Significant hazard potential classification dams are often located in predominantly rural or agricultural areas, but could be located in areas with population and significant infrastructure.

Low Hazard Potential

Dams assigned the low hazard potential classification are those where failure or mis-operation results in no probable loss of human life and low economic and/or environmental losses. Losses are principally limited to the owner's property.

Less Than Low Hazard Potential

Dams which do not pose high, significant, or low hazard potential.